

**MINUTES OF THE SPECIAL MEETING OF THE PRESBYTERY OF THE MIAMI VALLEY**  
**Wednesday, August 12, 2020**  
**VIA ZOOM**

**Approved at the September 8, 2020 stated presbytery meeting**

The meeting was convened with prayer at 10:00 a.m. on Wednesday, August 12, 2020, by Ruling Elder Alice McCollum, Moderator. The meeting was conducted virtually by Zoom, respecting governmental prohibitions on larger meetings due to the COVID-19 pandemic and the presbytery's desire to protect its members from the effects of the pandemic.

LEGEND:

P – Present    E – Excused    Blank – Absent    *Italics* – attendance recorded in more than one category

**OFFICERS OF THE PRESBYTERY OF THE MIAMI VALLEY**

<i>Ruling Elder Alice McCollum</i> , Moderator	P
<i>Minister of the Word and Sacrament Ben Beres</i> , Vice Moderator	E
<i>Ruling Elder Bruce Saunders</i> , Leadership Council Chair	E
<i>Ruling Elder Larry Hollar</i> , Stated Clerk	P
<i>Ruling Elder Kathleen Sewer</i> , Recording Clerk	P

**MINISTERS OF THE WORD AND SACRAMENT ON ACTIVE ROLL**

Adams, Garth	Haddox, Emily	Miller, Herbie	P
Allen, Todd	Hamilton, Susan	Murphy, Kevin	
Bain, Marciana	Helling, Michael	Neely, John	P
Baker, Jeri	Hernandez, David	Nile, Laura	
Baker, Richard	Hess, Lisa	Owens, Anna	
Bartel, Lawrence	Hinds, Kathryn Blocher	Pelaez-Díaz, Francisco	
Beres, Benjamin	Hodgkins, Nancy	Ramsey, Thomas	
Birdsong, Nancy	Ingram, Steven	Rupnik, Frank	P
Bova, Lynette	Isaacs, Michael	Schenck, Angela	P
Brakemeyer, Randall	Kobs, Erin	Shin, Kelley Wehmeyer	P
Brown, Beau	Kukuk, Terry	Soards, Marion	
Burslem, Kathleen	Lawler, Kevin	Sparks-Franklin, Sarah	
Cassedy, Karen	Lawrence, Ronald	Tidwell, Melissa	
Circelli, Diana	Lee, Sang Un	van Bulck, Marcel	P
Dardaganian, Brad	Lewis, John	Weaver, Denise	
Dennis, Ted	Linville, Deborah	Worthen, Merritt	P
Dozeman, Thomas	Maguire, Brian	Young, Darryll	
Duiker, Amy	Martin, Christopher	Ziegler, Diane	P
Garrigan, Carmen	McCormick, Dwight		
Haddox, Clifford	Merrin, Steven		P

**TEMPORARY MINISTER MEMBERS FROM OTHER DENOMINATIONS**

Gockel, Stan	P
Schaffnit, Daria	P
Schumm, Steven	P
Williamson, Julia	P
Whitt, Joe	

**HONORABLY RETIRED MINISTERS OF THE WORD AND SACRAMENT (Excused unless attendance indicated)**

Amidon, C. Forrest	Fleming, David L.	Hookey, Joseph R.
Barr, Judith Dunlap	Foubert, David	Horrigan, Kevin
Brown, Edward	Fulton, Robert	Howard, Kenneth
Conn, Arbuth	Gerhart, Andrew	Kester, Gordon L.
Creager, Ronald	Girbert, David A.	Kim, Soo Kwang
Davis-Dudding, Kay	Godfrey, Norman	McConnel, George H.
Edwards, Robert L.	Graham, James	McNulty, Edward
Evans, Michael	Hinds, Joe. M III	Meyers, JoAnne

Niece, Linda	P	Sparks, W. Franklin	Walthour, William
Nowak, Jacqueline		Stewart, Donald M.	Warren, Patrick
Philips, William		Swaim, Gerald G.	Yanney, William
Righter, Richard L.		Thornton, Jesse	Zuercher, John
Sheldon, Jocelyn J.	P	Wade, Robert	
Smith, Robert B., Jr.		Wall, Evan	

**ROLL OF CHURCHES (RULING ELDERS PRESENT)**

BELLBROOK		DAYTON: TRINITY	PIQUA: GOOD SHEPHERD
1 – Aldrich, Ray	P	1 – Smith, Rosemary	1 –
BELLE CENTER		DAYTON: WESTMINSTER	PIQUA: WESTMINSTER
1 –		1 – Kasch, Bill	1
BELLEFONTAINE		2 – Shonle, Joseph	REILY
1 –		3 –	1 –
BLUE BALL		EATON: FIRST	RUSHSYLVANIA
1 –		1 – Neavin, Bradley	1 -
BRADFORD		FAIRBORN: FIRST	SEVEN MILE
1 –Buker, Mike (CRE)		1 –	1 – Collins, Gidget (CRE) P
2 –		FARMERSVILLE: SLIFERS	2 --Durbin, MaryRose P
CLIFTON		1 –	SIDNEY: FIRST
1 –		HAMILTON: THE P. C.	1 –
COLLINSVILLE		1 – Eyer, Greg	SPRINGBORO: COVENANT
1 –		2 –Baer, Mary	1 –
COVINGTON		HAMILTON: WESTWOOD	SPRINGFIELD: COVENANT
1 –		1 -	1 – Storm, Rob P
DAYTON: BATH		HUBER HEIGHTS: FAITH	SPRINGFIELD: NORTHMINSTER
1 –		1 –	1 –
DAYTON: CENTRAL		HUNTSVILLE	TROY: FIRST
1 –		1 –	1 – Mauntler, John P
DAYTON: COLLEGE HILL		JAMESTOWN	2 –
1 –		1 –	URBANA: FIRST
DAYTON: CORINTH		MIDDLETOWN: FIRST	1 –
1 – Zeh, Barbara	P	1 –	WEST LIBERTY
DAYTON: FAIRMONT		MIDDLETOWN: ST. LUKE	1 -
1 –		1 -	WILMINGTON
DAYTON: IMMANUEL KOREAN		MONROE	1 – Gillette, Jim P
1 –		1 –	XENIA: UNITED
DAYTON: MEMORIAL		NEW CARLISLE: HONEY CREEK	1 –
1 -		1 –	YELLOW SPRINGS: FIRST
DAYTON: SOUTHMINSTER		NEW PARIS	1 –
1 – Davis, Elizabeth P		1 –	
2 –Cleaves, Gretchen P		OXFORD	
DAYTON: SUGAR CREEK		1 – Cross, Danny	P
1 – Morgan, Marge	P		

**RULING ELDER MEMBERS OF PRESBYTERY**

Courtney, Donna (LC)		Meadows, Pat (RD)	P	Shoemaker, Matt (LC)	
Hamilton, Kim (LC)	P	Morgan, Marge (COM)	P	Welborn, Diane (LC)	P
Hollar, Larry (SC)	P	Niece, Don (LC)	P	Woessner, Georgie (LC)	P
McCollum, Alice (Mod)	P	Saunders, Bruce (LC)	E		

**CORRESPONDING MEMBERS AND THOSE GRANTED VOICE** (not otherwise registered): Seated by presbytery rule: Ruling Elder Kathleen Seewer (Recording Clerk) Seated by presbytery vote: None.

**INQUIRERS AND CANDIDATES** (not otherwise registered): None

**STAFF MEMBERS OF PRESBYTERY** (not otherwise registered): Tom Oxley

++++++

**REPORT OF THE STATED CLERK – Ruling Elder Larry Hollar****Preliminary Business**

- A quorum was declared and the Clerk announced that the roll for today's meeting would be formed by advance registration of presbyters and confirmation of those registered being present electronically, accomplished by observation of their faces and names on Zoom and the participants list. The confirmed attendance consisted of twenty-eight (28) ministers of the Word and Sacrament, four (4) minister member from other denominations, seventeen (17) ruling elder commissioners (representing twelve (12) congregations), and seven (7) ruling elder members of presbytery: fifty-six (56) voting members. Also present and not otherwise registered was one (1) corresponding member seated by presbytery rule and none seated by presbytery vote, and one (1) presbytery staff member. Including duplicate categories, total registered attendance of fifty-eight (58). Four timely requests for an excuse were received from ministers of the Word and Sacrament or minister members, and approved by presbytery by unanimous consent. Approximately 27 devices were recorded as viewing the meeting on livestream.
- The Clerk declared the meeting properly called under the presbytery Bylaws by notice issued on July 30, 2020. The Clerk explained that one docket item that had been included in the Call of the Special Meeting has been removed. That item was a request from the Administrative Commission for the Collinsville Church that presbytery approve a Covenant of Gracious Separation that the AC and the Collinsville Church have negotiated. The Church requested, and the AC concurred, that that item be deferred until a later, undetermined date to allow the church to resolve some local issues with their township unrelated to the Covenant itself.
- The Clerk explained the special processes for this meeting by Zoom and provided an orientation to the various Zoom features that presbyters would be required to use during the meeting. Assistance was offered to anyone having trouble navigating their devices through the Chat function. A practice meeting had also been offered two days prior to this special meeting for anyone wishing to learn what was required electronically.
- Presbytery passed by unanimous consent (thereby satisfying the need for a 2/3 vote) the following Clerk's motion that the presbytery temporarily suspend provisions of the Bylaws to permit a virtual electronic meeting of presbytery to occur today. More permanent rules are expected to be adopted at the September 2020 stated meeting.
  - Motion from the Stated Clerk
    1. That the presbytery, pursuant to Section 8.01 of the Presbytery Bylaws, temporarily suspend for its August 12, 2020 special meeting any Bylaw provision, or excuse the lack of any Bylaw provision, that would impede the holding of an electronic meeting on that day in compliance with the *Book of Order* and *Robert's Rules of Order, Newly Revised*; and
    2. That the presbytery adopt the same operating provisions to apply on a temporary basis to the August 12, 2020 special meeting as were in effect for the May 12, 2020 stated presbytery meeting and June 2020 special meeting, and are contained on pp. 10-11 of the Advance Packet for the May 12 stated presbytery meeting, also held by Zoom: ([http://www.miamipresbytery.org/pmv\\_presby\\_docs.htm](http://www.miamipresbytery.org/pmv_presby_docs.htm)).
  - By unanimous consent, the revised docket was adopted.

**COMMITTEE ON PREPARATION FOR MINISTRY – Minister of the Word and Sacrament Michael Isaacs, chair**

On behalf of the committee, the chair presented the following rationale for the motions the committee has offered:

**Rationale:** In February 2019, the presbytery approved a new process for transferring minister membership for a minister who is currently a member of another denomination that is not in Full Communion with the Presbyterian Church (U.S.A.). This process draws from requirements in Sections 2.05 and 2.06 of the Book of Order.

The process sets up a rigorous evaluation process of the minister's academic credentials and competency in each of the areas that a candidate going through the preparation for ministry process needs to address: a Reformed understanding of theology, polity, worship and sacraments, and biblical exegesis. The minister

could satisfy the competency standards based on passing the ordination examinations of the denomination or by complying with certain challenging alternative means (G-2.0610) that were approved by a ¾ vote of presbytery in February 2019. The process assumes that normally the minister will have spent at least two years among us serving a church in this presbytery, and at least five years in ministerial service in the other denomination.

The Committee on Preparation for Ministry has been overseeing Rev. Steven Schumm’s progress through this process since the beginning of 2018. Rev. Schumm’s ministry membership is with the Mennonite Church USA, a denomination that is not a member of the World Communion of Reformed Churches.

Transfers of members from those Reformed denominations is made somewhat simpler under the Book of Order, but certainly members of other denominations can demonstrate competency in Reformed aspects of theology and practice, as Rev. Schumm has done. The entire purpose of using these alternative methods of approving a minister for transfer recognizes that ministers who are fully qualified academically, who demonstrate pastoral leadership capacity over a period of time, who are well-grounded theologically and practically in serving a PC(USA) church, and who want to become one of us as members, should have reasonable means to explore doing so.

Rev. Schumm has served as interim pastor at First Presbyterian Church of Urbana and interim associate pastor at Southminster Presbyterian Church in Dayton. He currently serves as stated supply pastor at the New Carlisle: Honey Creek Church. He has served for several years on the presbytery’s Network Support and Grants Committee and sat for a term on Leadership Council of the presbytery as the NS&G liaison.

**In assessing Rev. Schumm’s request for transfer, the Committee on Preparation for Ministry has:**

1. Affirmed the adequacy of Rev. Schumm’s ordination, his current credentials and good standing for ministry with another denomination, and his compliance with the constitutional conditions (G-2.0505, 2.0607);
2. Assessed Rev. Schumm’s academic credentials and found them satisfactory;
3. Evaluated his competency in the areas of Reformed theology, polity, worship and sacraments, and biblical exegesis by administering written examinations reviewed and graded by committee members and others, and conducting oral examinations.
4. Required Rev. Schumm to take a Presbyterian Polity course and examined him closely on his understanding of our polity;
5. Reviewed and discussed with him his Statement of Faith and other documents (copies of which are in appendices below);
6. Required Rev. Schumm to undergo a comprehensive background check;
7. Sought Committee on Ministry concurrence in moving forward (see below); and
8. Approved Rev. Schumm for examination for transfer on the floor of presbytery, which under G-2.0610 requires a ¾ vote of presbytery because the process involves waivers of the normal preparation for ministry process.

**In assessing Rev. Schumm’s request for transfer, the Committee on Ministry has:**

1. At the request of the Committee on Preparation for Ministry, concurred in the approval of Rev. Steven Schumm to be examined for transfer on the floor of presbytery; and
2. Found and confirmed that Rev. Steven Schumm’s membership in the presbytery would advance the presbytery’s mission, life, and work. (June 30, 2020)

+++++

Based on these findings of both committees, the chair, on behalf of the Committee on Preparation for Ministry, offered the following motions:

August 12, 2020

Presbytery of the Miami Valley

**Motion 1:** That the Presbytery of the Miami Valley examine the Rev. Steven Schumm for ordination and membership transfer to the Presbyterian Church (U.S.A.) pursuant to G-2.0505 and G-2.0610 of the Book of Order and of Section 1.09 of the CPM Policy and Practice.

Following opportunity for discussion, the presbytery adopted the motion by unanimous consent.

The Rev. Steven Schumm then orally presented his Statement of Faith (**Appendix A**). Presbyters were then invited to examine Rev. Schumm by asking questions on the Statement of Faith or other materials Rev. Schumm prepared and the committee provided as background: Statement of Call (**Appendix B**); Transfer Motivation and Expectations (**Appendix C**); and Brief Summary of Ministry and Experience (**Appendix D**). Nine presbyters asked questions and Rev. Schumm responded. The Moderator then declared the examination concluded. Rev. Schumm was removed to a Zoom waiting room.

The committee chair then offered the following motion on behalf of the committee.

**Motion 2:** That the Presbytery of the Miami Valley approve the transfer of ministerial membership and recognition of ordination of the Rev. Steven Schumm from the Mennonite Church (USA) to the Presbyterian Church (U.S.A.)

The moderator noted that the vote on this motion, which requires a  $\frac{3}{4}$  vote, would be taken by an electronic vote via Zoom. Without objection, presbytery approved that method of voting. Discussion occurred on Motion 2 with several presbyters offering support for the motion.

When no further presbyters wished to speak, the moderator presented Motion 2 for electronic vote via Zoom, and an opportunity for everyone finding themselves not able to vote with their devices to orally cast their votes. The vote was 53 votes in favor of the motion and 0 (zero) votes opposed, a sufficient number to satisfy the  $\frac{3}{4}$  vote requirement. So Motion 2 was adopted.

The committee chair then offered the following motion on behalf of the committee:

**Motion 3:** That the presbytery authorize the Stated Clerk to enter Rev. Schumm on the rolls of this presbytery as a minister of the Word and Sacrament upon receiving evidence that Rev. Schumm's membership in any other Christian churches has been surrendered.

Without objection the motion was adopted.

Rev. Schumm returned to the main room to applause as the Moderator announced the favorable vote. The Moderator asked Rev. Steven Schumm the Constitutional Questions appropriate for ministers of the Word and Sacrament from the Book of Order, and they were all answered in the affirmative. The moderator then prayed, and following that announced that Rev. Steven Schumm had been approved by this presbytery to become a minister of the Word and Sacrament on the rolls of the Presbyterian Church (U.S.A.) upon receipt and processing of the required papers from the Mennonite Church (USA) and any other necessary entities that Rev. Schumm no longer has ministerial status with them.

The Moderator warmly welcomed Rev. Schumm to our midst, and invited Rev. Schumm to speak, during which he expressed words of gratitude to individuals and committees of this presbytery for their support and friendship during this transfer process.

#### **ADJOURNMENT WITH CLOSING PRAYER**

The meeting was adjourned with prayer by Moderator Alice McCollum at 11:19 am.

The next Stated Meeting of the Presbytery of the Miami Valley will be held on Tuesday, September 8, 2020, at 3:00 p.m., via Virtual Electronic Means (Zoom).

Attest:

Ruling Elder Larry Hollar, Stated Clerk

**APPENDICES:**

- A. Statement of Faith—Rev. Steven Schumm
- B. Statement of Call—Rev. Steven Schumm
- C. Transfer Motivation and Expectations—Rev. Steven Schumm
- D. Brief Summary of Ministry and Experience--Rev. Steven Schum

REMAINDER OF PAGE INTENTIONALLY LEFT BLANK